

MIAMI BEACH

PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Staff Report & Recommendation

Design Review Board

TO: DRB Chairperson and Members

FROM: Thomas R. Mooney, AICP ^{DS}  for TRM
Planning Director

SUBJECT: DRB23-0941
4410 Alton Road

DATE: November 13, 2023

An application has been filed requesting Design Review Approval for the construction of a new 2-story home with an understory, on a vacant site.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approval.

LEGAL DESCRIPTION:

Lots 15 and 16, Block 5, of Nautilus Subdivision, According to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 95, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

SITE DATA:

Zoning: RS-4
Future Land Use: RS
Lot Size: 12,000 SF
Lot Coverage:
Proposed: 3,600/ 30%
Maximum: 3,600 SF / 30%
Unit size:
Proposed: 5,897 SF /49.1%
Maximum: 6,000 SF / 50%
Height:

Grade: +4.93' NGVD
Base Flood Elevation: +8.00' NGVD
Adjusted Grade: 6.46' NGVD
First Floor Elevation: +17'-4" NGVD (BFE+ 9'-4" FB)

EXISTING PROPERTY:

Year: 1933
Architect: T.H. Henderson
Vacant: Yes
Demolition: N/A

Proposed: 29'-8" Flat Roof*
Maximum: 31'-0" Flat roof *
From first
habitable floor: 25'-4"
*as measured from Max Freeboard

SURROUNDING PROPERTIES:

East: One-Story 1939 residence
North: Two-Story 1937 residence
South: One-Story 1953 residence
West: Two-Story 1933 residence

THE PROJECT:

The applicant has submitted plans entitled "House of Kirschner" as designed by **NMD Nomadas**, signed and sealed September 11th, 2023. The applicant is proposing a new, two-story single-family residence with an understory.

The applicant is requesting review for an understory area:

1. Understory area shall be subject to the review and approval of the Design Review Board in accordance with Section 7.2.2.3(b)(vi).

COMPLIANCE WITH ZONING CODE:

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the application, as proposed, appears to be inconsistent with the following sections of the City Code:

- Section 7.2.2.3(b)(vi). Subject to the review and approval of the Design Review Board the following may apply to the understory area(s): Understory area(s) shall be used only for open air activities, parking, building access, mechanical equipment, non-enclosed restrooms and storage.
- The yard shall comply with the minimum and maximum yard elevation of Section 7.2.2.3(b)(x) of the Resiliency Code.

The above noted comments shall not be considered final zoning review or approval. These and all zoning matters shall require final review and verification by the Zoning Administrator prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.

COMPLIANCE WITH DESIGN REVIEW CRITERIA, SECTION 2.5.3.1:

Design review encompasses the examination of architectural drawings for consistency with the criteria stated below, with regard to the aesthetics, appearance, safety, and function of any new or existing structure and physical attributes of the project in relation to the site, adjacent structures and surrounding community. The design review board and the planning department shall review plans based upon the below stated criteria, criteria listed in neighborhood plans, if applicable, and applicable design guidelines. Recommendations of the planning department may include, but not be limited to, comments from the building department and the public works department.

- a. The existing and proposed conditions of the lot, including but not necessarily limited to topography, vegetation, trees, drainage, and waterways.
Satisfied
- b. The location of all existing and proposed buildings, drives, parking spaces, walkways, means of ingress and egress, drainage facilities, utility services, landscaping structures, signs, and lighting and screening devices.
Satisfied
- c. The dimensions of all buildings, structures, setbacks, parking spaces, floor area ratio, height, lot coverage and any other information that may be reasonably necessary to determine compliance with the requirements of the underlying zoning district, and any applicable overlays, for a particular application or project.
Satisfied
- d. The color, design, selection of landscape materials and architectural elements of exterior building surfaces and primary public interior areas for developments requiring a building permit in areas of the city identified in section 2.5.3.2.
Satisfied
- e. The proposed site plan, and the location, appearance and design of new and existing buildings and structures are in conformity with the standards of this article and other applicable ordinances, architectural and design guidelines as adopted and amended periodically by the design review board and historic preservation board and all pertinent master plans.

Satisfied

- f. The proposed structure, or additions or modifications to an existing structure, indicates a sensitivity to and is compatible with the environment and adjacent structures, and enhances the appearance of the surrounding properties.

Satisfied

- g. The design and layout of the proposed site plan, as well as all new and existing buildings shall be reviewed so as to provide an efficient arrangement of land uses. Particular attention shall be given to safety, crime prevention and fire protection, relationship to the surrounding neighborhood, impact on contiguous and adjacent buildings and lands, pedestrian sight lines and view corridors.

Satisfied

- h. Pedestrian and vehicular traffic movement within and adjacent to the site shall be reviewed to ensure that clearly defined, segregated pedestrian access to the site and all buildings is provided for and that all parking spaces are usable and are safety and conveniently arranged; pedestrian furniture and bike racks shall be considered. Access to the site from adjacent roads shall be designed so as to interfere as little as possible with traffic flow on these roads and to permit vehicles a rapid and safe ingress and egress to the site.

Satisfied

- i. Lighting shall be reviewed to ensure safe movement of persons and vehicles and reflection on public property for security purposes and to minimize glare and reflection on adjacent properties. Lighting shall be reviewed to assure that it enhances the appearance of structures at night.

Not Satisfied; a lighting plan has not been submitted.

- j. Landscape and paving materials shall be reviewed to ensure an adequate relationship with and enhancement of the overall site plan design.

Satisfied

- k. Buffering materials shall be reviewed to ensure that headlights of vehicles, noise, and light from structures are adequately shielded from public view, adjacent properties and pedestrian areas.

Satisfied

- l. The proposed structure has an orientation and massing which is sensitive to and compatible with the building site and surrounding area and which creates or maintains important view corridor(s).

Satisfied

- m. The building has, where feasible, space in that part of the ground floor fronting a street or streets which is to be occupied for residential or commercial uses; likewise, the upper floors of the pedestal portion of the proposed building fronting a street, or streets shall have residential or commercial spaces, shall have the appearance of being a residential or commercial space or shall have an architectural treatment which shall buffer the appearance of the parking structure from the surrounding area and is integrated with the overall appearance of the project.

Satisfied

- n. The building shall have an appropriate and fully integrated rooftop architectural treatment which substantially screens all mechanical equipment, stairs and elevator towers.
Satisfied
- o. An addition on a building site shall be designed, sited and massed in a manner which is sensitive to and compatible with the existing improvement(s).
Not Applicable
- p. All portions of a project fronting a street or sidewalk shall incorporate an architecturally appropriate amount of transparency at the first level in order to achieve pedestrian compatibility and adequate visual interest.
Satisfied
- q. The location, design, screening and buffering of all required service bays, delivery bays, trash and refuse receptacles, as well as trash rooms shall be arranged so as to have a minimal impact on adjacent properties.
Satisfied
- r. In addition to the foregoing criteria, subsection 118-104-6(t) of the General Ordinances shall apply to the design review board's review of any proposal to place, construct, modify or maintain a wireless communications facility or other over the air radio transmission or radio reception facility in the public rights- of-way.
Not Applicable
- s. The structure and site comply with the sea level rise and resiliency review criteria in chapter 7, article I, as applicable.
Not Satisfied; see below

COMPLIANCE WITH SEA LEVEL RISE AND RESILIENCY REVIEW CRITERIA

Section 7.1.2.4(a)(i) of the Land Development Regulations establishes review criteria for sea level rise and resiliency that must be considered as part of the review process for board orders. The following is an analysis of the request based upon these criteria:

1. A recycling or salvage plan for partial or total demolition shall be provided.
Not Satisfied
A recycling plan shall be provided as part of the submittal for a demolition/building permit to the building department.
2. Windows that are proposed to be replaced shall be hurricane proof impact windows.
Satisfied
3. Where feasible and appropriate, passive cooling systems, such as operable windows, shall be provided.
Satisfied
4. Resilient landscaping (salt tolerant, highly water-absorbent, native or Florida friendly plants) shall be provided, in accordance with Chapter 4 of the Land Development Regulations.
Satisfied

5. The project applicant shall consider the adopted sea level rise projections in the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Action Plan, as may be revised from time-to-time by the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Change Compact. The applicant shall also specifically study the land elevation of the subject property and the elevation of surrounding properties.

Satisfied

6. The ground floor, driveways, and garage ramping for new construction shall be adaptable to the raising of public rights-of-ways and adjacent land and shall provide sufficient height and space to ensure that the entry ways and exits can be modified to accommodate a higher street height of up to three (3) additional feet in height.

Satisfied

7. In all new projects, all critical mechanical and electrical systems shall be located above base flood elevation. Due to flooding concerns, all redevelopment projects shall, whenever practicable, and economically reasonable, move all critical mechanical and electrical systems to a location above base flood elevation.

Satisfied

8. Existing buildings shall be, where reasonably feasible and economically appropriate, elevated up to base flood elevation, plus City of Miami Beach Freeboard.

Satisfied

9. When habitable space is located below the base flood elevation plus City of Miami Beach Freeboard, wet or dry flood proofing systems will be provided in accordance with Chapter of 54 of the City Code.

Not Applicable

10. In all new projects, water retention systems shall be provided.

Satisfied; additional information will be required at the time of building permit in order to demonstrate compliance.

11. Cool pavement materials or porous pavement materials shall be utilized.

Satisfied; additional information will be required at the time of building permit in order to demonstrate compliance.

12. The project design shall minimize the potential for a project causing a heat island effect on site.

Satisfied; additional information will be required at the time of building permit in order to demonstrate compliance.

STAFF ANALYSIS: **DESIGN REVIEW**

The applicant is proposing to construct a new two-story residence with an understory on a vacant lot. The prior residence on the lot was demolished in 2017 (BR1700896).

The proposed residence is designed in the the tropical modern style, with an undestory on the ground level. The elevated two-story massing of the home is accessed by a prominent set of steps withn the front yard and the propsoed residence is finished in painted stucco, accoya wood sliding in a natural wood stain, thin phenolic panels with simulated wood. The proposed design incorporates natural movement that is indicative of the tropicity of the city and

amplifies the versatile vegetation of Florida. The structure includes a rain garden and a roof system that provides another layer of visual interest and warm tones.

The first fully enclosed, habitable floor of the residence is designed at an elevation of +17'-4" NGVD, or BFE plus 9'-4". The design intention is to create a larger, non-air-conditioned space below the main slab of the first habitable floor that serves as a usable outdoor recreational amenity and program area for the owner. This includes a waterfall, deck, 'topographic mountain steps', and a staircase for access to the upper floors. The understory area also provides a more resilient residence with the first habitable floor at a higher elevation. In this design, the proposed understory contains parking and storage, as well as an open dining and living area with direct access to the pool deck, all of which is finished in pavers compacted in a sand base.

The applicant is proposing a building height of 29'-8" as measured from design flood elevation (B.F.E. plus freeboard). While the applicant is below the maximum building height, staff recommends a reduction in the overall height by 8" in order to be more compatible with the surrounding neighborhood while maintaining an understory height of 10'. In addition, the applicant will be required to reduce the elevation of all paved surfaces in the front yard to comply with the maximum yard elevation requirements in Section 7.2.2.3(b)(x) of the Resiliency Code.

Staff is supportive of the proposed residence with an understory area and recommends the approval of this application with the conditions set forth in the attached draft order.

RECOMMENDATION:

In view of the foregoing analysis, staff recommends the application be **approved**, subject to the conditions enumerated in the attached Draft Order, which address the inconsistencies with the aforementioned Design Review and Sea Level Rise criteria.

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
City of Miami Beach, Florida

MEETING DATE: November 13, 2023

PROPERTY/FOLIO: **4410 Alton Rd / 02-3222-011-1150**

FILE NO: DRB23-0941

IN RE: An application for Design Review Approval for the construction of a new 2-story home with an understory, on a vacant lot.

LEGAL: Lots 15 and 16, Block 5, of Nautilus Subdivision, According to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 95, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

APPLICANT: Mauricio Rivera Kirschner

ORDER

The City of Miami Beach Design Review Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

I. Design Review

- A. The Board has jurisdiction pursuant to Section 2.1.3.1 of the Land Development Regulations. The property is not located within a designated local historic district and is not an individually designated historic site.
- B. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted is inconsistent with Design Review Criteria i. and s. in Section 2.5.3.1 of the Land Development Regulations.
- C. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted is inconsistent with Sea Level Rise Criteria 1 in Section 7.1.2.4(a)(i) of the Land Development Regulations.
- D. The project would be consistent with the criteria and requirements 2.5.3.1 and/ or Section 7.1.2.4(a)(i) if the following conditions are met:
 - 1. Revised elevation, site plan, and floor plan drawings for the proposed new home shall be submitted, at a minimum, such drawings shall incorporate the following:
 - a. The understory **shall be** approved as proposed.

- b. The overall height of the home shall be reduced by eight (8”) inches, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff.
 - c. The final design details of the exterior materials and finishes shall be submitted, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Design Review Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - d. URBAN HEAT ISLAND ORDINANCE Section 7.5.3.2(g)(iv) Driveways and parking areas that are open to the sky within any required yard shall be composed of porous pavement or shall have a high albedo surface consisting of a durable material or sealant, as defined in Section 1.2.1 of this Code, and (v) Driveways and parking areas composed of asphalt that does not have a high albedo surface, as defined in Section 1.2.1, shall be prohibited.
 - e. A copy of all pages of the recorded Final Order shall be scanned into the plans submitted for building permit, and shall be located immediately after the front cover page of the permit plans.
 - f. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the project Architect shall verify, in writing, that the subject project has been constructed in accordance with the plans approved by the Planning Department for Building Permit.
2. A revised landscape plan, prepared by a Professional Landscape Architect, registered in the State of Florida, and corresponding plans shall be submitted to and approved by staff. The species, type, quantity, dimensions, spacing, location and overall height of all plant material shall be clearly delineated and subject to the review and approval of staff. At a minimum, such plans shall comply with Chapter 4-Landscape Requirements of the Miami Beach Code and shall incorporate the following:
- a. The plans shall comply with the line-of-sight visibility triangle requirements, subject to the review and approval of the Public Works Department.
 - b. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a tree protection plan for all trees to be retained on site. Such plan shall be subject to the review and approval of staff, and shall include, but not be limited to a sturdy tree protection fence installed at the dripline of the trees prior to any construction.
 - c. In order to identify, protect and preserve mature trees on site, which are suitable for retention and relocation, a Tree Report prepared by a Certified Tree Arborist shall be submitted for the mature trees on site.
 - d. Any tree identified to be in good overall condition shall be retained and protected in their current location if they are not in conflict with the proposed home, or they shall be relocated on site, if determined feasible, subject to the review and approval of staff. A tree care and watering plan also prepared by a Certified Arborist shall be submitted prior to the issuance of a Building Permit or Tree Removal/Relocation Permit. Subsequent to any approved relocation, a monthly report prepared by a Certified Arborist shall be provided

to staff describing the overall tree performance and adjustments to the maintenance plan in order to ensure survivability, such report shall continue for a period of 18 months unless determined otherwise by staff.

- e. Existing trees to be retained on site shall be protected from all types of construction disturbance. Root cutting, storage of soil or construction materials, movement of heavy vehicles, change in drainage patterns, and wash of concrete or other materials shall be prohibited.
- f. The proposed and existing trees located within the swale shall be subject to the review and approval of Green Space and CIP.
- g. Street trees shall be required within the swale at the front of the property if not in conflict with existing utilities, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by the Public Works Department. Any new street trees shall be of a consistent canopy tree species as similar to the neighboring trees along the street.
- h. Any existing plant material within the public right-of-way may be required to be removed, as the discretion of the Public Works Department.
- i. A fully automatic irrigation system with 100% coverage and an automatic rain sensor in order to render the system inoperative in the event of rain. Right-of-way areas shall also be incorporated as part of the irrigation system.
- j. The utilization of root barriers and/or Silva Cells, as applicable, shall be clearly delineated on the revised landscape plan.
- k. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the Landscape Architect or the project architect shall verify, in writing, that the project is consistent with the site and landscape plans approved by the Planning Department for Building Permit.

In accordance with section 2.2.4.8 of the Land Development Regulations, the applicant, the City Manager, Miami Design Preservation League, Dade Heritage Trust, or an affected person may appeal a decision of the design review board for design review approval only to the city commission, except that orders granting or denying a request for rehearing shall not be reviewed by the commission.

II. Variance(s)

- A. No variance(s) were filed as part of this application.

The decision of the Board regarding variances shall be final and there shall be no further review thereof except by resort to a court of competent jurisdiction by petition for writ of certiorari.

III. General Terms and Conditions applying to both 'I. Design Review Approval and 'II. Variances' noted above.

- A. Upon the issuance of a final Certificate of Occupancy or Certificate of Completion, as applicable, the project approved herein shall be maintained in accordance with the plans approved by the board and shall be subject to all conditions of approval herein, unless otherwise modified by the Board. Failure to maintain shall result in the issuance of a Code Compliance citation, and continued failure to comply may result in revocation of the Certificate of Occupancy, Completion and Business Tax Receipt.
- B. During construction work, the applicant shall maintain gravel at the front of the construction site within the first 15'-0" of the required front yard and including the swale (subject to the review and approval of Public Works), to mitigate disturbance of soil and mud by related personal vehicles exiting and entering the site. All construction materials, including dumpsters and portable toilets, shall be located behind the construction fence and not visible from the right-of-way.
- C. During the course of construction, all vehicles, including, but not limited to all personal vehicles, shall park within the confines of the private property, the swale directly abutting the construction site, or at alternate overflow parking sites that are not on-street metered spaces and not zoned RS. Additionally, parking of any vehicles shall be prohibited in the travel lanes of all streets.
- D. All allowable construction signage shall be attached to or situated behind the construction fence and shall be limited to one (1) sign, not to exceed four (4) square feet, in accordance with Section 6.3.2 of the Land Development Regulations.
- E. The building and parking departments shall approve a construction parking plan prior to the issuance of any building permit, including applicable demolition permits for the project.
- F. The applicant shall ensure that the contractor(s) observe good construction practices and prevent construction materials and debris from impacting the right-of-way.
- G. The contractor(s) shall ensure that the street and the swale directly abutting the construction site remains free of debris and refuse at all times; at a minimum, the contractor(s) shall inspect and clear the street and swale areas before leaving at the end of each day.
- H. This order shall be enforced by the Building, Planning, Parking and Code Compliance Departments.
- I. A recycling/salvage plan shall be provided as part of the submittal for a demolition/building permit, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff.
- J. A copy of all pages of the recorded Final Order shall be scanned into the plans submitted for building permit and shall be located immediately after the front cover page of the permit plans.

- K. The Final Order shall be recorded in the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.
- L. Satisfaction of all conditions is required for the Planning Department to give its approval on a Certificate of Occupancy; a Temporary Certificate of Occupancy or Partial Certificate of Occupancy may also be conditionally granted Planning Departmental approval.
- M. The Final Order is not severable, and if any provision or condition hereof is held void or unconstitutional in a final decision by a court of competent jurisdiction, the order shall be returned to the Board for reconsideration as to whether the order meets the criteria for approval absent the stricken provision or condition, and/or it is appropriate to modify the remaining conditions or impose new conditions.
- N. The conditions of approval herein are binding on the applicant, the property's owners, operators, and all successors in interest and assigns.
- O. Nothing in this order authorizes a violation of the City Code or other applicable law, nor allows a relaxation of any requirement or standard set forth in the City Code.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the staff report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff recommendations, which were amended and adopted by the Board, that the application for Design Review approval is GRANTED for the above-referenced project subject to those certain conditions specified in Paragraph I, II, III of the Finding of Fact, to which the applicant has agreed.

PROVIDED, the applicant shall build substantially in accordance with the revised plans entitled "House of Kirschner" as designed by **NMD Nomadas**, signed and sealed September 11th 2023, and as approved by the Design Review Board, as determined by staff.

When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions of approval that must be satisfied prior to permit issuance, as set forth in this Order, have been met.

The issuance of the approval does not relieve the applicant from obtaining all other required Municipal, County and/or State reviews and permits, including final zoning approval. If adequate handicapped access is not provided on the Board approved plans, this approval does not mean that such handicapped access is not required. When requesting Building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order.

If the Full Building Permit for the project is not issued within eighteen (18) months of the meeting date at which the original approval was granted, the application will expire and become null and void, unless the applicant makes an application to the Board for an extension of time, in accordance with the requirements and procedures of Section 2.2.4.6 of the Land Development Regulations; the granting of any such extension of time shall be at the discretion of the Board. If the Full Building Permit for the project shall expire for any reason (including but not limited to construction not commencing and continuing, with required inspections, in accordance with the

Filed with the Clerk of the
Design Review Board on: _____ (_____)